## Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

RECEIVED

AUG 5 1996

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF SECRETARY

In the Matter of Southwestern Bell Telephone CC Docket Nos. 85-229, 90-623 and 95-20 Company's Comparably Efficient Interconnection Plan for the Provision of Internet Support Services Bell Atlantic's Offer of Comparably CCBPol. 96-09 Efficient Interconnection to Providers DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL of Enhanced Internet Access Services Implementation of the Non-Accounting CC Docket No. 96-149 Safeguards of Sections 271 and 272 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended

## SOUTHWESTERN BELL TELEPHONE COMPANY'S COMMENTS IN OPPOSITION TO PETITION TO CONSOLIDATE PROCEEDINGS

Southwestern Bell Telephone Company ("SWBT"), by its attorneys, hereby opposes the Petition to Consolidate Proceedings ("petition"), filed on July 25, 1996, by MFS Communications Company, Inc. ("MFS"). In particular, the Commission should deny MFS' request that the record developed regarding SWBT's Comparably Efficient Interconnection ("CEI") Plan for Internet Support Services¹ be consolidated with the BOC In-Region rulemaking proceeding.<sup>2</sup>

Na. of Capies roots OFII

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Southwestern Bell Telephone Company's Comparably Efficient Interconnection Plan for the Provision of Internet Support Services, filed June 21, 1996.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Implementation of the Non-Accounting Safeguards of Section 271 and 272 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, CC Docket No. 96-149, Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, (continued...)

As the Bureau has recently recognized, a CEI plan approval proceeding is limited to determining whether the plan complies with the Commission's Computer III requirements.<sup>3</sup> These requirements impose obligations with respect to nine specific CEI parameters and with respect to certain nonstructural safeguards prescribed by the Commission.<sup>4</sup> SWBT's CEI Plan identifies all of the required parameters and safeguards, and details how SWBT intends to comply fully with each of them.

MFS' petition makes no claim that SWBT has failed to identify any parameter or safeguard, and it makes no claim that SWBT's compliance with any parameter or safeguard is deficient. In fact, MFS fails to state any claim that SWBT's CEI Plan is objectionable under the Commission's Computer III requirements (or even under the Telecommunications Act of 1996 ("Act")). MFS' attempt to consolidate this matter with the BOC In-Region Rulemaking proceeding should be rejected for this reason alone.

MFS recites that there are "common issues" raised between this proceeding and the proceedings culminating in the Bureau's issuance of the Bell Atlantic CEI Order, such that both should be consolidated into the BOC In-Region rulemaking proceeding. Such bootstrapping suffers from two key defects.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>(...continued) released July 18, 1996 ("BOC In-Region rulemaking proceeding").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Bell Atlantic Telephone Companies, Offer of Comparably Efficient Interconnection to Providers of Internet Access Services, CCBPol 96-09, <u>Order</u>, released June 6, 1996 ("Bell Atlantic CEI Order"), at para. 47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Amendment of Section 64.702 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations, Phase I, <u>Report and Order</u>, 104 FCC 2d 958 (1986) (further citations omitted) ("Phase I Order"), at paras. 154-166; Phase II, 2 FCC Rcd 3072 (1987) (further citations omitted) ("Phase II" Order"), at paras. 73-75.

First, MFS' pleading fails to allege what these "common issues" are, much less persuade that such issues would even be material to the Bureau's determination. To the contrary, the lack of commonality is betrayed by MFS' own pleading. For instance, MFS objects to Bell Atlantic's "integrated offering" but elsewhere acknowledges that "[u]nlike Bell Atlantic, Southwestern Bell proposes to offer Internet services through a separate affiliate."

Second, even assuming the existence of such common issues, MFS' argument is beside the point. The Bureau has already determined, for good reasons, that Bell Atlantic's CEI plan should not be rejected, notwithstanding MFS' various claims that it may not be consistent with portions of the Act. Thus, the Bureau concluded that MFS' interconnection and unbundling arguments based on Sections 251 and 252 of the Act were best addressed in a rulemaking proceeding, and that its interLATA arguments based on Sections 271 and 272 of the Act were best addressed in a separate rulemaking proceeding.<sup>7</sup> The Bureau should take the same approach here, particularly given the lack of any objection by MFS to SWBT's CEI Plan.

MFS' petition for consolidation should be viewed for what it actually is: an attempt to "stay" Bureau approval of SWBT's CEI Plan until the conclusion of the BOC In-Region rulemaking proceeding. The Bureau has already correctly decided that CEI plan approval should not have to await completion of a separate rulemaking. That policy decision was sound when made and remains sound now. Consolidation here would be particularly inappropriate given that the two proceedings involve, on the one hand, a service-specific CEI plan about which MFS offers no

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> MFS Petition, at 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> MFS Petition, at 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Bell Atlantic CEI Order, at paras. 47 (referring to the Interconnection NPRM) and 51 (referring to the BOC In-Region NPRM), respectively.

complaints, and on the other, an industry-wide, vigorously debated, administrative rulemaking covering a plethora of subjects.

In sum, the matter at hand is limited to SWBT's compliance with the Commission's established CEI plan requirements. To the extent that there are any matters here (though not identified by MFS) that will be affected by the future policy decisions made in the BOC In-Region rulemaking, SWBT's CEI Plan may be subject to those decisions. At present, however, the Bureau should deny MFS' petition and approve SWBT's CEI Plan for Internet Support Services.

Respectfully submitted,

SOUTHWESTERN BELL TELEPHONE COMPANY

Robert M. Lynch

Durward D. Dupre

Michael J. Zpevak

Robert J. Gryzmala

Attorneys for

Southwestern Bell Telephone Company

One Bell Center, Room 3520 St. Louis, Missouri 63101

(314) 235-2507

August 5, 1996

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Moreover, as a practical matter, consolidation would be unnecessary given that the Bureau has already determined that Bell Atlantic's provisioning of Internet services on an interLATA basis will be subject to the requirements established in the BOC In-Region rulemaking proceeding. <u>Id.</u>, at para. 51. The Bureau's position in this regard is sufficient, without more, and consistency requires that neither this proceeding nor the proceeding involving Bell Atlantic's CEI plan should be consolidated with the BOC In-Region rulemaking proceeding.

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Liz Jensen, hereby certify that the foregoing Southwestern Bell Telephone Company's Comments In Opposition to Petition to Consolidate Proceedings, CC 85-229, 90-623 and CCBPol 96-09 and 96-149, have been served this 5th day of August, 1996 to the Parties of Record.

hiz Jensen

Liz Jensen

August 5, 1996

POLICY AND PROGRAM PLANNING DIVISION COMMON CARRIER BUREAU 1919 M STREET NW ROOM 544 WASHINGTON DC 20554 (2 COPIES) JAMES S BLASZAK
D E BOEHLING
ATTORNEYS FOR AD HOC TELECOM
COMMITTEE
LEVINE BLASZAK BLOCK & BOOTHBY
1300 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW
SUITE 500
WASHINGTON DC 20005

USERS

ALBERT H KRAMER
ROBERT F ALDRICH
DANA J LESEMANN
KECK MAHIN CATE
AMERICAN PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS
COUNCIL
1201 NEW YORK AVENUE NW
PENTHOUSE SUITE
WASHINGTON DC 20005-3919

HOLLIS G DUENSING
GENERAL SOLICITOR
THE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICAN
RAILROADS
50 F STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20001

HENRY D LEVINE
MARY O'CONNELL
MORRISON & FOERSTER
CALIFORNIA BANKERS CLEARING
HOUSE ASSOCIATION
2000 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW
SUITE 5500
WASHINGTON DC 20006

STEPHEN D RUUD
COMMISSION COUNSEL
COLORADO PUBLIC UTILITIES
COMMISSION
1580 LOGAN STREET OL-2
DENVER CO 80203

HERBERT E MARKS
JODY D NEWMAN
SQUIRE SANDERS & DEMPSEY
STATE OF HAWAII
1201 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW
PO BOX 407
WASHINGTON DC 20004

JOHN F DODD
BRAD I PEARSON
SMITH GILL FISHER & BUTTS
INDEPENDENT TELECOMMUNICATIONS
NETWORK INC
ONE KANSAS CITY PLACE
1200 MAIN STREET 35TH FL
KANSAS CITY MO 64105-2107

J ROGER WOLLENBERG
W SCOTT BLACKMER
WILMER CUTLER & PICKERING
INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS MACHINES
CORPORATION
2445 M STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20037

HENRY L BAUMANN
TERRY L ETTER
NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
BROADCASTERS
1771 N STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20036

W BENNY WON
ASSISTANT ATTORNEY GENERAL
OREGON PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
JUSTICE BUILDING
SALEM OREGON 97310

JOSEPHINE S TRUBEK
GENERAL COUNSEL
ROCHESTER TELEPHONE CORP
180 S CLINTON AVENUE
ROCHESTER NEW YORK 14646

SHARON L NELSON
WASHINGTON UTILITIES AND
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
1300 S EVERGREEN PARK DR SW
OLYMPIA WASHINGTON 98504-9022

SAMUEL LOUDENSLAYER
ARKANSAS PUBLIC SERVICE
COMMISSION
1000 CENTER STREET
LITTLE ROCK AR 72203-0400

ROWLAND CURRY
PUC OF TEXAS
7800 SHOAL CREEK BLVD STE 400N
AUSTIN TEXAS 78757

LINDIL FOWLER
GENERAL COUNSEL
OKLAHOMA CORPORATION COMMISSION
JIM THORPE BLDG
2101 N LINCOLN STE 400
OKLAHOMA CITY OK 73105

BENJAMIN A MCKNIGHT CHAIRMAN AICPA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMITTEE 1211 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS NEW YORK NY 10036 HERBERT E MARKS
JONATHAN JACOB NADLER
JEFFREY A CAMPBELL
SQUIRE SANDERS & DEMPSEY
THE INDEPENDENT DATA COMMUNICATIONS
MANUFACTURERS ASSOCIATION INC
1201 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
PO BOX 407
WASHINGTON DC 20044

ANN J LAFRANCE
KERRY E MURRAY
SQUIRE SANDERS & DEMPSEY
MCGRAW-HILL INC
1201 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
P O BOX 407
WASHINGTON DC 20044

WARD W WUESTE HQE03J43 600 HIDDEN RIDGE IRVING TEXAS 75038 RICHARD MCKENNA HQE03J36 GTE SERVICE CORPORATION PO BOX 152092 IRVING TEXAS 75015-2092 JOHN F STURM
SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT
GOVERNMENT LEGAL AND POLICY
NEWSPAPER ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA
529 14TH STREET NW
SUITE 440
WASHINGTON DC 20045-1402

RICHARD E WILEY
MICHAEL YOURSHAW
STEVEN A AUGUSTINO
WILEY REIN & FIELDING
ATTORNEYS FOR NEWSPAPER ASSOCIATION
OF AMERICA
1776 K STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20006

ITS INC 1919 M STREET NW ROOM 246 WASHINGTON DC 20037

M ROBERT SUTHERLAND A KIRVEN GILBERT III BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS INC 1155 PEACHTREE STREET SUITE 1700 ATLANTA GEORGIA 30309-3610 ELLEN G BLOCK
LEVINE LAGAPA & BLOCK
COUNSEL FOR THE CALIFORNIA BANK
CLEARNING HOUSE NEW YORK CLEARING
HOUSE ASSOC & MC INTERNATIONAL
INC
1200 NINETEENTH ST NW #602
WASHINGTON DC 20036

MICHAEL E. GLOVER
LAWRENCE W KATZ
COUNSEL FOR THE BELL ATLANTIC
TELEPHONE COMPANIES
1320 NORTH COURT HOUSE ROAD
ARLINGTON, VIRGINIA 22201

WERNER K HARTENBERGER
J G HARRINGTON
STEVEN F MORRIS
DOW LOHNES & ALBERTSON
ATTORNEYS FOR COX ENTERPRISES
1255 TWENTY-THIRD STREET NW
SUITE 500
WASHINGTON DC 20037

GLENN B MANISHIN
JOHN S DI BENE
CHARON J HARRIS
BLUMENFELD & COHEN
1615 M STREET NW SUITE 700
WASHINGTON DC 20036

RANDOLPH J MAY
DAVID I ADELMAN
ATTORNEYS FOR COMPUSERVE INC
SUTHERLAND ASBILL & BRENNAN
1275 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004-2404

MICHAEL S PANEK ATTORNEY FOR AMERITECH 2000 WEST AMERITECH CENTER DRIVE ROOM 4H84 HOFFMAN ESTATES IL 60196-1025 WILLIAM D BASKETT III
JOHN K ROSE
CHRISTOPHER J WILSON
ATTORNEYS FOR CINCINNATI BELL
TELEPHONE CO
2500 PNC CENTER
201 EAST FIFTH STREET
CINCINNATI OHIO 45202

JEFFREY A. CAMPBELL
SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY
ATTORNEY FOR MCI TELECOMMUNICATIONS
CORPORATION, INFORMATION
TECHNOLOGY ASSOC. OF AMERICA,
AND COMPUSERVE INCORPORATED
1201 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
PO BOX 407
WASHINGTON DC 20044-0407

RICHARD A ASKOFF
ATTORNEY FOR THE NATIONAL EXCHANGE
CARRIER ASSOC INC
100 SOUTH JEFFERSON ROAD
WHIPPANY NEW JERSEY 07981

STEVEN J METALITZ
VP AND GENERAL COUNSEL
INFORMATION INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION
555 NEW JERSEY AVENUE NW
SUITE 800
WASHINGTON DC 20001

DANIEL L BRENNER
DAVID L NICOLL
ATTORNEYS FOR THE NATIONAL CABLE
TELEVISION ASSOC INC
1724 MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20036

ALBERT H KRAMER
ROBERT F ALDRICH
DANA J LESEMANN
ATTORNEYS FOR THE NORTH
AMERICAL TEL ASSOC
KECK MAHIN & CATE
1201 NEW YORK AVENUE NW
PENTHOUSE SUITE
WASHINGTON DC 20005-3919

PAUL RODGERS
CHARLES D GRAY
JAMES BRADFORD RAMSAY
NATIONAL ASSOC OF REGULATORY
UTILITY COMMISSIONERS
1102 ICC BUILDING
P O BOX 684
WASHINGTON DC 20044

EDWARD R WHOLL CAMPBELL L AYLING WILLIAM J BALCERSKI COUNSEL FOR NYNEX 1111 WESTCHESTER AVENUE WHITE PLAINS NY 10604 OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE 1425 STRAWBERRY SQUARE HARRISBURG PA 17120 JAMES P TUTHILL
JEFFREY B. THOMAS
PACIFIC BELL/NEVADA BELL
140 NEW MONTGOMERY ST ROOM 1525
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105

KEITH J. EPSTEIN BRUCE A. RAMSEY PACIFIC BELL/NEVADA BELL 3401 CROW CANYON ROAD, SUITE 100 SAN RAMON, CALIFORNIA 94583

JAMES L WURTZ
MARGARET E GARBER
PACIFIC BELL/NEVADA BELL
1275 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004

JAMES L WURTZ
ATTORNEY FOR PACTEL
1275 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20004

ANNE U MACCLINTOCK
VP-REGULATORY AFFAIRS
& PUBLIC POLICY
227 CHURCH STREET
NEW HAVEN CONNECTICUT 06510

R MICHAEL SENKOWSKI JEFFREY S LINDER WILEY REIN & FIELDING 1776 K STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20006

JAY C KEITHLEY
ATTORNEY FOR THE UNITED AND
CENTRAL TELEPHONE COMPANIES
1850 M STREET NW
SUITE 1100
WASHINGTON DC 20036

CRAIG T SMITH ATTORNEY FOR THE UNITED AND CENTRAL TELEPHONE COMPANIES P O BOX 11315 KANSAS CITY MO 64112

MARY MCDERMOTT
VP AND GENERAL COUNSEL
1401 H STREET NW
SUITE 600
WASHINGTON DC 20005

ROBERT B. MCKENNA ATTORNEY FOR U S WEST COMMUNICATIONS INC 1020 19TH STREEET NW SUITE 700 WASHINGTON DC 20036 JEFFREY SHELDON
THOMAS GOODE
ATTORNEYS FOR THE UTILITIES
TELECOMMUNICATIONS COUNCIL
1140 CONNECTICUT AVE NW
SUITE 1140
WASHINGTON DC 20036

GAIL POLIVY 1850 M STREET NW SUITE 1200 WASHINGTON DC 20036

JOHN J LANGHAUSER
MARK C ROSENBLUM
CLIFFORD K WILLIAMS
ATTORNEYS FOR AT&T CORP
295 NORTH MAPLE AVENUE
ROOM 3244J1
BASKING RIDGE NEW JERSEY 07920

JANET RENO
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
10TH ST & CONSTITUTION AVE NW
ROOM 4400
WASHINGTON DC 20530

WILLIAM KENNARD
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF GENERAL COUNSEL
1919 M STREET NW RM 602
WASHINGTON DC 20554

PEGGY REITZEL
POLICY AND PROGRAM PLANNING DIVISION
COMMON CARRIER BUREAU
1919 M STREET NW
ROOM 544
WASHINGTON DC 20554

MAUREEN O HELMER GENERAL COUNSEL NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SERVICE THREE EMPIRE STATE PLAZA ALBANY NY 12223 CHERYL L PARRINO SCOTT A NEITZEL PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF WISCONSIN 610 NORTH WHITNEY WAY PO BOX 7854 MADISON WI 53707-7854

ALAN J GARDNER
JERRY YANOWITZ
JEFFREY SINSHEIMER
CALIFORNIA CABLE TV ASSOC.
4341 PIEDMONT AVENUE
OAKLAND CALIFORNIA 94611

FRANK W LLOYD
DONNA N LAMPERT
SARA F SEIDMAN
MINTZ LEVIN COHN FERRIS
GLOVSKY AND POPEO PC
ATTORNEYS FOR THE NATIONAL CABLE
TELEVISION ASSOCIATION INC.
701 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
SUITE 900
WASHINGTON DC 20004

CATHERINE R. SLOAN
RICHARD FRUCHTERMAN
LDDS COMMUNICATIONS INC
1120 CONNECTICUT AVENUE NW
WASHINGTON DC 20034

PETER A ROHRBACH LINDA L OLIVER HOGAN & HARTSON 555 13TH STREET NW WASHINGTON DC 20005

RONALD L PLESSER
JULIE A GARCIA
MARK J OCONNOR
PIPER & MARBURY
COUNSEL FOR THE COMMERCIAL
INERNET EXCHANGE ASSOCIATION
1200 19TH STREET NW
SEVENTH FLOOR
WASHINGTON DC 20036

ROBERT J BUTLER
PAUL C SMITH
WILEY REIN & FIELDING
ATTORNEYS FOR THE ASSOCIATION OF
TELEMESSAGING SERVICES
INTERNATIONAL INC
1776 K STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20006

ALBERT SHULDINER
ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSEL
INFORMATION INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION
555 NEW JERSEY AVENUE NW
SUITE 800
WASHINGTON DC 20001

JOSEPH P MARKOSKI
JONATHAN JACOB NADLER
JEFFREY A CAMPBELL
SQUIRE SANDERS & DEMPSEY
ATTORNEYS FOR THE INFORMATION
TECHNOLOGY ASSOC OF AMERICA
1201 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE NW
PO BOX 407
WASHINGTON DC 20044

FRANK W KROGH DONALD J ELARD 1801 PENNSYLVANIA AVE NW WASHINGTON DC 20006 SUSAN M MILLER
VP AND GENERAL COUNSEL
COUNSEL FOR THE INFORMATION
INDUSTRY LIAISON COMMITTEE
1200 G STREET NW SUITE 500
WASHINGTON DC 20005

ANDREW D LIPMAN
MARK SIEVERS
SWIDLER & BERLIN CHARTERED
COUNSEL FOR MFS COMMUNICATIONS GROUP INC
3000 K STREET NW SUITE 300
WASHINGTON DC 20007

JANICE MYES FCC COMMON CARRIER BUREAU 1919 M ST NW RM 544 WASHINGTON DC 20554